

Closing the Gap: Offtakers' Willingness to Pay for Low-carbon Hydrogen

Public Report



About Aurora and the European Hydrogen Services

Introducing Aurora's speakers

AUR 😞 RA











Anise Ganbold

Head of Research, Global Energy Markets and Hydrogen Bea Dunlop

Commercial Associate

Zhiyu Yang

Analyst

Gaetano Garfi Associate Aashwij Prabhu

Senior Analyst

For more information, please contact **Bea Dunlop, Commercial Associate**

 ⊠
 Bea.dunlop@auroraer.com

 ☎
 +44 (0) 1865952700

Source: Aurora Energy Research

Subscribe to powerful forecast and data services for tailored research into market developments, policy interpretation, and topical energy market issues

Subscription Analytics: Forecasts & Insight Analysis

Software Solutions

AUR 🙅 RA



Putting our power market model into your hands



Quantifying the true value of your wind project in minutes

The leading battery analytics software



Solar market software (coming soon)

Power & Renewables Service

Robust, transparent analysis, widely used and trusted amongst major market participants

Bankable forecasts to support asset financing and in-depth analysis to underpin your investment strategies



Grid Add-On

Granular analysis of network constraints and impact on the economics of generation and flexibility assets, including scenarios with varying network capacity

EOS Subscriber Platform

Flexible Energy Add-On

Detailed analysis and granular forecasts for power, balancing,

and ancillary service markets plus investment case data for a wide

range of battery storage and gas

peaker business models



Hydrogen Service

Crucial analysis into market sizing and drivers

Dedicated insights following policy developments and project activities across power, heat, transport, and industry

RORA









A global perspective: Subscribe to one or multiple regional products for consistent and comparative services across the globe



AUR 😞 RA

Our market leading models underpin a comprehensive range of seamlessly integrated services to best suit your needs





Models & Data

Market-leading models for power, gas, hydrogen, carbon, oil & coal markets

Proprietary and continuously updated cutting-edge models populated with highest quality curated datasets **Developed over 10 years, 40+ dedicated modellers**

Discover the major players across the value chain subscribing or contributing to our European Hydrogen Market Service





Source: Aurora Energy Research

Our European Hydrogen Market Service keeps you up-to-date with regular insights, policy & market updates, and roundtable discussions

Full European Hydrogen Market Subscription Analytics Service

Forecast Reports & Data



Hydrogen Market Report (HyMaR) & Investment Case Analysis

- Summary of policy & regulatory developments and incentives across Europe
- Hydrogen market sizing: demand scenarios by country and sector
- Analysis of demand and supply drivers
- Hydrogen production economics based on Aurora's in-house power, gas and carbon price forecasts
- Forecasted Hydrogen prices out to 2060
- Global electrolyser project database



Interactive Online Database and Scenario Explorer

Explore scenarios through EOS, our dynamic online platform featuring a full library of reports and datasets.



Strategic Insights

Strategic Insight Reports

Regular insight reports on topical issues in the evolving European hydrogen market covering country, policy, and technology deep dives



Policy Updates

- Regular updates on European Hydrogen policies and incentives across power, heat, transport, and industry
- Thought leadership on required policies and incentives to grow the hydrogen sector



AUR 🖴 RA

Group Meetings

- Presentation of Market Attractiveness reports and Strategic Insight reports
- Networking opportunity with developers, investors, and Governments—the 'go-to' roundtable to discuss hydrogen developments in Europe



Analyst Support

Bi-annual workshops and support from our bank of analysts, including native speakers and on-the-ground experts

What's coming up in the European Hydrogen Market Service?

AUR 😞 RA

Major deliverables of European Hydrogen Service in 2024



Selected existing reports¹

Strategic Insights

- Analysis of European Hydrogen Bank auctions
- Seas of opportunity: economics of hydrogen from offshore co-location
- A traded hydrogen market in Europe: what will prices and market structures look like?
- The economics of hydrogen imports: better to stay local?
- Financing electrolysers: overview of market trends in Europe
- Hydrogen in mobility: understanding the economics and incentives
- Shades of green (hydrogen) part 2: in pursuit of 2 €/kg

Country deep-dives

- Hydrogen in the NLD: from natural gas to green hydrogen hub
- The role of green hydrogen in the I-SEM
- Policies, regulation, and economics of green hydrogen in France
- Green hydrogen in Germany could colocation become a new business model for renewables?
- The role of green hydrogen in Iberia
- Hydrogen for a Net Zero Great Britain
- Low carbon hydrogen in the Nordics
- Net Zero and the role of hydrogen for the Italian power system

About Aurora and the European Hydrogen Services

Aurora is launching a Multi-Client Study focusing on the development of e-fuels in Europe

- The study aims to provide in-depth insights into the market and pricing dynamics of four key e-fuels, via a Multi-Client-Study (MCS). This allows us to create a comprehensive analysis at a competitive rate, while simultaneously bringing key players in the e-fuel sector together. The critical questions we aim to answer are:
 - What are the drivers of e-fuel demand?
 - Which e-fuels will be crucial for the decarbonisation of industry, aviation, maritime, and road transportation?
 - What is the market size for e-fuels?
 - What factors will determine the competitive advantage of e-fuel producers across Europe?
 - How will cost and price developments evolve for each e-fuel?
 - How will costs vary under different business models for e-fuel producers?

For more details on our approach and scope please reach out to us directly

Contact: Kevin.Caballero@auroraer.com

e-fuels in focus



AUR 🖴 RA



I. Setting the scene

- II. Willingness to pay for hydrogen in the ammonia sector
- III. Willingness to pay for hydrogen in the steel industry
- IV. UK's Hydrogen Allocation Rounds and willingness to pay
- V. Key takeaways

 ☑
 Bea.dunlop@auroraer.com

 ☎
 +44 (0) 1865952700

Hydrogen is a key feedstock in industry, used primarily in refining and ammonia production, and is predominantly fossil fuel-derived



1) Only include countries covered by European Hydrogen Observatory. 2) Latest available data. 3) SMR: Steam methane reforming. 4) CCS: Carbon capture and storage.

AUR 🗢 RA

1

Low-carbon hydrogen will be instrumental to decarbonising hard-to-abate sectors, but high production costs present challenges for adoption



While switching to low-carbon hydrogen is fundamental to decarbonise sectors currently consuming grey hydrogen, the deployment of low-carbon hydrogen-based solutions in other sectors depends on the level of policy support and hydrogen's cost-competitiveness against other alternatives.

| | Current hydrogen consumers | Hard-to-abate industries | Hard-to-abate transport | Others |
|-------------------------------------|---|---|-------------------------|-------------------------------|
| First-mover sectors ¹ | Ammonia, Refining | Steel | n.a. | n.a. |
| Other sectors | Methanol ² and others ³ | Process heat, Power generation | Maritime, Aviation | Road transport, Space heating |
| Decarbonisation alternative | n.a. | Natural gas, RES ⁴ based electrification, CCS ⁵ | Biofuels, Electricity | Biofuels, Electricity |
| Competitiveness of hydrogen | | | | |

The main obstacles to low-carbon hydrogen deployment in the most promising sectors is the **gap between offtakers' willingness to pay and high costs for producing low-carbon hydrogen.**

2

Focus sector: Ammonia

Based on public information, four out of seven European Hydrogen Bank winning projects are dedicated to ammonia, marking it as the most promising offtaker.

Focus sector: Steel

New applications

Europe has at least 52Mtpa hydrogen-ready steel capacity in pipeline, backed by multiple private funding and 9.6bn € of state aid.

1) Sectors with the highest offtake potential for low-carbon hydrogen in the short-term based on public offtake information. 2) Majority of methanol production relies on hydrogen currently. Biomass could contribute to mass production of methanol in the future. 3) Other includes hydrochloric acid production, hydrogen as a coolant, etc. 4) RES: Renewable energy sources. 5) CCS: Carbon capture and storage. Sources: Aurora Energy Research, The Chemical Engineer

Several policy instruments can bridge the cost gap between low-carbon hydrogen and the incumbent technology

Policy instruments, implemented in certain countries and industries, aim to accelerate the switch to low-carbon hydrogen with a 'carrot and stick' approach: on the one hand, public funding is provided for producers and offtakers of low-carbon hydrogen to support the formation of an ecosystem. On the other hand, penalties benchmarked to GHG¹ emission and RFNBO² consumption mandates can bring relative disadvantage to incumbent carbon-intensive technologies.

| | For producers | For producers and offtakers | For offtakers | |
|---|--|---|---|--|
| Incentivising Policies that provide incentives for the switch to low-carbon hydrogen. | Production side support More than 10bn € are dedicated to support low-carbon hydrogen production across Europe via different schemes. | n.a. | Offtake side support Germany financial support to offtakers by its 4bn € Carbon Contract for Difference (CCfD) scheme. | |
| Incentivising and Penalising Market-based schemes benchmarked to emission. | n.a. | Emission pricing Low-carbon hydrogen reduces carbon costs and provides additional revenue from free allowances for both producers and offtakers. | Low-carbon certificates Low-carbon hydrogen helps with meeting emission quotas in the transport sector in Germany and the UK. | |
| Penalising Policies that penalise the decision to not switch to low-carbon hydrogen. | n.a. | n.a. | RFNBO² consumption mandates The Fit-for-55 package sets binding RFNBO mandates for key sectors, with penalties in place for aviation and maritime transport. | |

1) GHG: Greenhouse gas. 2) RFNBO: Renewable fuels of non-biological origin.

Sources: Aurora Energy Research, European Commission, UK Department for Transport, German Federal Ministry of Justice (BMJ)

AUR 🖴 RA

We define the "floor" to willingness to pay as the price hydrogen has to reach to match the cost of the reference competing technology

AUR 😞 RA



1) Production costs between different technologies are compared on a levelised basis. 2) WtP: Willingness to pay.





I. Setting the scene

- II. Willingness to pay for hydrogen in the ammonia sector
- III. Willingness to pay for hydrogen in the steel industry
- IV. UK's Hydrogen Allocation Rounds and willingness to pay
- V. Key takeaways

 ☑
 Bea.dunlop@auroraer.com

 ☎
 +44 (0) 1865952700

Willingness to pay for hydrogen in the ammonia sector

Low-carbon hydrogen is key to decarbonising ammonia production and downstream chemical industries

AUR 😞 RA



1) SMR: Steam methane reforming. 2) About 5-10% of CO₂ cannot be captured economically with current blue hydrogen technologies. 3) CCS: Carbon capture and storage. 4) According to 2021 assumption by the IEA. 5) Based on nutrient content.

Sources: Aurora Energy Research, International Energy Agency (IEA), International Fertiliser Association

Willingness to pay for hydrogen in the ammonia sector

Redacted version. Figures available to subscribers.

Willingness to pay for low-carbon $\rm H_2$ accounts for current grey $\rm H_2$ costs, net carbon revenues, and costs for additional equipment



Levelised floor WtP¹ for RFNBO² hydrogen, Germany (COD³ 2030) $\in /kg H_2$ (real 2023)



1) WtP: Willingness to pay. 2) RFNBO: Renewable fuels of non-biological origin. 3) COD: Commercial operation date. 4) LCOH: Levelised cost of hydrogen. 5) SMR: Steam methane reforming. 6) HPA: Hydrogen purchase agreement. Based on the cheapest option for variable offtake, published in Aurora's Apr-24 HyMaR databook. 7) ETS: Emission trading scheme Source: Aurora Energy Research

The incorporation of RED III¹ mandates on a national level can increase WtP² and reduce the need for subsidies and/or a green premium





5.7

RED III set a binding mandate for RFNBO³ use in industry. With Union-level precedents⁴ of penalties for non-compliance, it is possible that Member States will implement financial enforcement measures to ensure mandates are realised. Amid the uncertainty of penalties, we designed three scenarios to assess potential impacts on WtP.

Subsidy/green premium required to enable switch to RFNBO H₂ under different policy scenarios (COD⁵ 2030) \notin /kg H₂ (real 2023)

The expected median industrial offtake price from the European Hydrogen Bank pilot auction sits above WtP in the low financial penalty scenario, suggesting offtakers may have factored in the risk of a financial penalty for non-compliance.

| | | oram | iancial penalty for non-compliance. |
|---|--|---|---|
| | | | |
| | | | |
| RFNBO HPA Price | RED III compliance - High financial penalty | RED III compliance - Low financial penalty | RED III compliance - No financial penalty |
| Introducing a reasonable financial penalty for non-compliance with RED III RFNBO consumption targets could be instrumental to favouring the switching to RFNBO H ₂ . | If the non-compliance penalty were to resemble the one introduced for non- compliance with RefueIEU SAF ⁶ targets in aviation, WtP could increase more than three-fold. | In a scenario in which the financial penalty for non-compliance is set to benchmark against the EUA ⁷ market price, WtP could increase by more than 30%. | No additional contribution to WtP is expected if failure to comply with RED III 42% share does not translate into a financial penalty. |

🗾 RFNBO HPA Price 航 Subsidy/green premium required 📕 RED III compliance 📕 Floor WtP 💶 European Hydrogen Bank pilot auction median industrial offtake price

1) RED III: Renewable Energy Directive, i.e. (EU) 2018/2001 revised by (EU) 2023/2413.2) WtP: Willingness to pay. 3) RFNBO: Renewables fuels of non-biological origin. 4) Precedents include penalties in RefuelEU directives and others such as penalty on nonsurrender of allowances in ETS. 5) COD: Commercial operation date. 6) SAF: Sustainable aviation fuels. 7) EUA: EU allowance. Sources: Aurora Energy Research, European Commission



- I. Setting the scene
- II. Willingness to pay for hydrogen in the ammonia sector
- III. Willingness to pay for hydrogen in the steel industry
- IV. UK's Hydrogen Allocation Rounds and willingness to pay
- V. Key takeaways

 ⊠
 Bea.dunlop@auroraer.com

 ☎
 +44 (0) 1865952700

Europe produces 7% of the world's steel and shows a robust pipeline of DRI¹ based projects aimed at decarbonising primary steel production

Overview of the steelmaking industry

Crude steel production 2023 and capacity of DRI project pipeline⁴ Global crude steel production by region, 2023 Mtpa crude steel Mt 1,891 0.7 9.0 355 4.3 0.0 NOR **SWE** 76 81 87 4.7 0.0 0.0 133 DNK 0.0 0.0_35.4 140 GBR 0.0 0.0 NLD IRX 5.9 13.8 0.0 2.5 CZH DEU 7.1 BEL 10.0 0.0 6.7 1,019 AUT 21.1 11.4 FRA 2.0 7.7 ITA 0.0 **ESP** PRT China RoW³ Total India Europe² United Russia Japan **States** Crude steel production in 2023 New technology project pipeline⁵

1) DRI: Direct reduced iron. 2) EU27 + UK + Norway + Switzerland. 3) RoW: Rest of world. 4) Only HyMaR countries and other non-EU countries with production greater than 1.5 Mtpa are shown. 5) DRI only & DRI-EAF (electric arc furnace) plants are considered. Where DRI capacity is not known, the crude steel capacity is shown. 6Mtpa DRI plant by Blastr not shown on the map due to location uncertainty.

AUR 😞 RA

3.8

2.5

FIN

6.4

0.0

0.0

SVK

0.0

1.6

ROU

POL

4.4

We estimate the floor offtakers' willingness to pay for low-carbon H_2 in the steel sector by comparing four different production technologies



1) BF-BOF: Blast furnace-basic oxygen furnace. 2) DRI-EAF: Direct reduced iron-electric arc furnace. 3) Reducing agent is the commodity used to convert iron ore (oxide) to metal iron.

Source: Aurora Energy Research

AUR 😞 RA

The floor H₂ willingness to pay can be defined as the price that would make the H_2 -based technology competitive with the traditional one





1) COD: Commercial operation date. 2) BOF: Blast furnace-basic oxygen furnace. 3) DRI-EAF: Direct reduced iron-electric arc furnace. 4) RFNBO: Renewable fuels of non-biological origin. 5) WtP: Willingness to pay. 6) For a metal scrap recycling rate of 50%. 7) Others include FOM, feedstock transport, delivery, industrial gases, ferroalloys, fluxes and labour Source: Aurora Energy Research



- I. Setting the scene
- II. Willingness to pay for hydrogen in the ammonia sector
- III. Willingness to pay for hydrogen in the steel industry
- IV. UK's Hydrogen Allocation Rounds and willingness to pay
- V. Key takeaways

 ☑
 Bea.dunlop@auroraer.com

 ☎
 +44 (0) 1865952700

While the UK and EU share similarities in implementing ETS¹ and a CBAM², notable differences are found in the design of their hydrogen auctions



| | European Union | United Kingdom | |
|---|---|--|--|
| Consumption | RED III³ introduced RFNBO⁴ consumption mandates in industry. | No consumption mandates in industry. | |
| mandates | RefuelEU set consumption mandates for aviation and maritime sectors. | | |
| Austina | • EHB ⁵ auctions allocate financial support in the form of a fixed premium. | UK Hydrogen Allocation Rounds (HAR) provide operational support via | |
| Auction design for hydrogen | The first round cleared at 0.48 €/kg H₂. | a contract for difference (CfD) scheme. | |
| | | The first round, HAR1, cleared at a weighted average strike price of £241/MWh (~£9.5/kg H₂), with natural gas price setting the floor price. | |
| | Transition phase ("reporting only") between 2023 and end of 2025. | No transition period. Fully operational from 2027. | |
| Carbon border adjustment mechanism | Electricity, hydrogen, cement, fertilisers, aluminium, iron and steel sectors are included. | Ceramics, glass, hydrogen, cement, fertilisers, aluminium, iron and steel sectors are included. | |
| | EU importers must surrender EU CBAM certificates priced at the EUA⁶ price at the time of surrendering. | UK CBAM will be operated as a levy similar to other import taxes, the price of which would be sector-specific and set quarterly by the government. | |
| | FTS¹ allowance price \notin /toppe CO ₂ -eq (real 2023) | The UK launched its own emission trading scheme in 2021. | |
| Emissions trading scheme | Aurora central | The phaseout of free allowances in the UK-ETS is only concrete for the aviation sector by 2026. However, for our analysis we assumed that the pace of the phaseout will follow benchmarks and phaseout factors as set in the EU ETS. | |
| | 2025 2030 2035 2040 2045 2050 — EU-ETS — UK-ETS | Industries are exposed to the UK-ETS without the carbon price support (CPS). | |

1) ETS: Emissions Trading Scheme. 2) CBAM: Carbon border adjustment mechanism. 3) Renewable Energy Directive, i.e. (EU) 2018/2001 revised by (EU) 2023/2413. 4) RFNBO: Renewable fuels of non-biological origin. 5) EHB: European Hydrogen Bank. 6) EUA: European Union allowance. 7) CPS: Carbon price support.

Sources: Aurora Energy Research, European Commission, Department for Energy Security and Net Zero

UK's Hydrogen Allocation Rounds and willingness to pay

Willingness to pay for low-carbon $\rm H_2$ in the ammonia sector is expected to exceed the floor price^1 set in the CfD² scheme from HAR1³





According to our analysis the potential willingness to pay for low-carbon H₂ for ammonia production is well above the floor price¹ set in HAR1 for the CfD across the forecast horizon.

HAR1 CfD components and low-carbon $H_2\,WtP^4$ in ammonia sector $\pm/\text{MWh}_{\text{HHV}}$ (real 2023)



| How does the design of the CfD floor price relative to WtP impact different stakeholders? | | |
|---|--|--|
| Stakeholder | Impact | |
| Electrolyser project developers | + Securing an offtake is facilitated. | |
| | Offtakers are incentivised to sign HPAs ⁵ with longer tenure, reducing electrolyser projects' merchant tail. | |
| Hydrogen offtakers | + Cost to decarbonise is reduced. | |
| | \oplus Low-carbon H ₂ price risk is reduced. | |
| | Current consumers of grey H ₂ may be able to save money relative to their current costs by switching to low-carbon H ₂ . | |
| Government | \oplus Propels low-carbon H ₂ economy. | |
| | Little incentive to low-carbon H ₂ producers to try to secure a higher offtake price. | |
| | Risk of over-subsidisation. | |

Floor WtP in the ammonia sector CfD floor price (Aurora Central)¹

- - Weighted average CfD strike price

1) 120% of Aurora's Apr-24 Central forecast of UK natural gas price in alignment with Section 9.9 of the Low-carbon Hydrogen Agreement regarding hydrogen use as feedstock. 2) CfD: Contract for difference. 3) HAR1: Hydrogen Allocation Round 1. 4) WtP: Willingness to pay. 5) HPA: Hydrogen purchase agreement.

Sources: Aurora Energy Research, Department for Energy Security and Net Zero

Agenda



- I. Setting the scene
- II. Willingness to pay for hydrogen in the ammonia sector
- III. Willingness to pay for hydrogen in the steel industry
- IV. UK's Hydrogen Allocation Rounds and willingness to pay
- V. Key takeaways

 ⊠
 Bea.dunlop@auroraer.com

 ☎
 +44 (0) 1865952700

Key takeaways



A key barrier to adopting low-carbon hydrogen in end use sectors is the gap between the cost of the hydrogen and the incumbent, fossil-fuel based technology.



In Germany, offtakers' willingness to pay for low-carbon hydrogen in the ammonia sector is expected to grow over time. The gap between willingness to pay and German domestic HPA¹ prices remains substantial across the forecast horizon but could be mitigated by the implementation of a financial penalty for non-compliance with RED III² RFNBO³ consumption targets.



The growth of willingness to pay for low-carbon hydrogen in the steel industry is driven by the strong sensitivity to the rise in the carbon price of the traditional coal-based production route.



Similar levels of willingness to pay for low-carbon hydrogen are expected in the UK. Although the CfD scheme delivered through Hydrogen Allocation Rounds can expedite the commercial closure of projects, its current design carries the risk of excessive subsidisation.

1) Hydrogen purchase agreement. 2) Renewable Energy Directive, i.e. (EU) 2018/2001 revised by (EU) 2023/2413. 3) Renewable fuels of non-biological origin.

Source: Aurora Energy Research

AUR 😞 RA

ENERGY RESEARCH